

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART 1. EVIDENCE AND PROCEDURE

CHAPTER 1. THE ARBITRATION PROCESS

1.1	The Rules of Natural Justice	2
1.1.1	General	2
1.1.2	<i>Audi Alteram Partem</i> : The Right to Respond	3
1.1.3	The Rule against Bias	3
1.1.4	Death/Resignation of a Board Member	7
1.2	Sources of Jurisdiction	7
1.2.1	The Collective Agreement	7
1.2.2	Ancillary or Side Documents	8
1.2.3	Legislation	10
1.2.4	<i>Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i>	14
1.3	Weber: What is the Proper Forum?	17

CHAPTER 2. PROCEDURAL OBJECTIONS TO ARBITRABILITY

2.1	Grievances Arising under a Prior Collective Agreement	24
2.2	Defects in Form	26
2.3	Failure to Follow Grievance Procedure	27
2.4	Lack of Employee Signature	28
2.5	Individual, Group and Policy Grievances	28
2.6	Time Limits	30
2.6.1	Is the Language Mandatory or Directory?	30
2.6.2	Waiver	31
2.6.3	Continuing Breach	32
2.6.4	Laches – Excessive Delay	32
2.6.5	Statutory Discretion to Extend Time Limits	33

CHAPTER 3. FUNDAMENTAL OBJECTIONS TO ARBITRABILITY

3.1	Matters Not Covered by the Collective Agreement	36
3.1.1	General	36
3.1.2	Pre-Employment Matters	37
3.2	Collective Agreement Not in Effect	38
3.3	Settlement of the Grievance	40

3.4 Withdrawal of a Prior Grievance 42

3.5 Mootness 43

3.6 Matters Previously Decided 44

 3.6.1 *Res Judicata* and Issue Estoppel 44

 3.6.2 Arbitral Deference to Prior Awards 50

3.7 *Functus Officio* – Mandate Spent 51

3.8 Discharge of Probationary Employees 52

3.9 Insured Benefit Plans 54

CHAPTER 4. PRE-HEARING PROCEDURE

4.1 Entitlement to Notice/Status 60

4.2 Particulars 64

4.3 Production of Documents 65

 4.3.1 Arbitral Jurisdiction 65

 4.3.2 Scope of Production 66

 4.3.3 Remedy for Non-Compliance 67

4.4 Summons to a Witness 67

4.5 Medical Examination of Employee 68

CHAPTER 5. PROCEDURE AND PROOF AT THE HEARING

5.1 Adjournment 71

 5.1.1 Concurrent Proceedings 72

5.2 Public Access to Hearings 73

5.3 Disqualification of Counsel 75

5.4 Tape-Recording of Proceedings 75

5.5 Exclusion of Witnesses 76

5.6 Interpreters 77

5.7 Consolidation of Grievances 78

5.8 Onus and Standard of Proof, Order of Proceeding 78

5.9 Testifying by Teleconference 79

5.10 Motion for Non-Suit 80

5.11 Reply Evidence 82

5.12 The Rule in *Browne v. Dunn* 83

5.13 Medical Reports 84

5.14 Business Records 85

5.15 Credibility 86

5.16 Failure to Call a Witness 87

5.17 Withdrawal of Grievance 87

CHAPTER 6. ADMISSIBILITY OF EVIDENCE

6.1 Statutory Discretion 89

6.2 Best Evidence Rule 91

6.3	Charter Evidentiary Issues	91
6.4	The Rule Against Hearsay	92
6.5	Exceptions	93
	6.5.1 Necessity and Reliability	93
	6.5.2 <i>Res Gestae</i> – “In the Course of the Act”	94
	6.5.3 Admission by a Party	94
6.6	Similar Fact Evidence	95
6.7	Privilege	96
	6.7.1 Statements in the Grievance Procedure	96
	6.7.2 Documents Prepared in Contemplation of Litigation ...	97
	6.7.3 Labour Relations Privilege	99
	6.7.4 Public Interest Immunity	101
	6.7.5 Privilege Based on Personal Privacy	101
6.8	Videotape Surveillance Evidence	104
6.9	Tape-Recorded Conversations	107
6.10	Polygraph Testing	108
6.11	Expert Evidence	109

CHAPTER 7. REMEDIAL POWERS OF THE ARBITRATOR

7.1	Modification of the Penalty	111
	7.1.1 Post-Discharge Evidence: <i>Québec Cartier</i>	111
	7.1.2 Arbitral Responses to <i>Québec Cartier</i>	112
7.2	Reinstatement	116
7.3	Declarations	118
7.4	Damages	119
	7.4.1 The “Make-Whole” Principle	119
	7.4.2 <i>Weber</i> Damages	120
	7.4.3 Non-Monetary Losses	121
	7.4.4 Damages to the Union At Large	122
	7.4.5 Compensation for Tax Consequences	123
	7.4.6 Interest	123
7.5	The Duty to Mitigate	124
7.6	Rectification	126
7.7	Interim/Injunctive Relief	128
7.8	<i>Quia Timet</i> – Compliance Order	130
7.9	Restitution and Set-Off	130
7.10	Costs	132

CHAPTER 8. ENFORCEMENT AND REVIEW OF AWARDS

8.1	Enforcement of Arbitration Awards	133
	8.1.1 Enforcement by Filing in Court	134
	8.1.2 Stay of Proceedings	135

- 8.1.3 Contempt of Court 135
- 8.1.4 Enforcement by Prosecution 136
- 8.2 Judicial Review of Arbitration Awards 137**
 - 8.2.1 Contract Interpretation 137
 - 8.2.2 Interpretation of Legislation or Common Law Rules . . 140
 - 8.2.3 Findings of Fact 141
 - 8.2.4 Procedural and Evidentiary Rulings 142
 - 8.2.5 Access to Judicial Review by the Grievor 142
- 8.3 The Role of Labour Boards 143**
 - 8.3.1 Appellate or Review Role 143
 - 8.3.2 Overlapping Jurisdiction with Labour Board 144

CHAPTER 9. DUTY OF FAIR REPRESENTATION

- 9.1 Scope of the Duty: General 146**
- 9.2 Application for Judicial Review 150**
- 9.3 The Impact of Human Rights Legislation 150**

PART 2. DISCHARGE AND DISCIPLINE

CHAPTER 10. DISCHARGE AND DISCIPLINE: GENERAL PRINCIPLES

- 10.1 The Just Cause Standard 152**
 - 10.1.1 Collective Agreement Silent on Just Cause 154
 - 10.1.2 Statutory Just Cause Standard 155
- 10.2 Culminating Incident and Prior Record 156**
 - 10.2.1 What Constitutes a Culminating Incident? 156
 - 10.2.2 What Forms Part of the Prior Record? 157
- 10.3 Onus of Proof and Order of Proceeding 160**
 - 10.3.1 Employee’s Failure to Provide an Explanation 161
- 10.4 Standard of Proof 162**
- 10.5 Double Discipline Prohibited 163**
- 10.6 Non-Compliance with Disciplinary Procedure 164**
 - 10.6.1 When Is Union Representation Required? 165
 - 10.6.2 Other Procedural Defects 167
 - 10.6.3 Waiver 168
 - 10.6.4 Reimposition of Discipline 169
 - 10.6.5 Remedial Discretion 170
- 10.7 Delay in Imposing Discipline 170**
- 10.8 Alteration of Grounds Prohibited 171**
 - 10.8.1 Exceptions 171

10.9 Assessment of Discipline	172
10.9.1 Factors Affecting Penalty	173
10.9.2 Illness or Disorder as a Mitigating Factor	176
10.9.3 Progressive Discipline	177
10.9.4 Compensation in Lieu of Reinstatement	178

CHAPTER 11. DISHONEST AND ILLEGAL CONDUCT

11.1 Dishonesty	179
11.2 Falsification of Records	180
11.2.1 Application Forms	180
11.2.2 Attendance and Production Records	181
11.2.3 Medical Certificates	183
11.3 Abuse of Sick Leave	183
11.4 Theft	184
11.4.1 Definition of Theft	186
11.5 Vandalism or Sabotage	186
11.6 Off-Duty Conduct	187
11.6.1 Criminal Convictions	188
11.6.2 Criminal Charges	189
11.6.3 Onus and Standard of Proof	191

CHAPTER 12. DISLOYALTY AND BREACH OF TRUST

12.1 Breach of Trust	193
12.2 Conflict of Interest	193
12.2.1 Public Sector	193
12.2.2 Private Sector	195
12.3 Public Criticism of Employer Policies	196

CHAPTER 13. INSUBORDINATE AND ABUSIVE CONDUCT

13.1 Insubordination – The “Work Now, Grieve Later” Rule	198
13.1.1 Definition of Insubordination	200
13.2 Exceptions	201
13.2.1 Health and Safety	201
13.2.2 Illegality	202
13.2.3 Union Officials	202
13.2.4 Personal Appearance	204
13.2.5 Medical Examinations and Disclosure of Medical Information	204
13.2.6 Grievance Procedure Would Not Provide Adequate Remedy	206
13.2.7 Grievance in Anticipation of Discipline	207

13.3	Failure to Comply with Employer Rules	207
13.4	Employer Rules Affecting Privacy	208
13.4.1	Searches	208
13.4.2	Drug and Alcohol Testing	209
13.4.3	Video Surveillance	213
13.4.4	Polygraph Testing	216
13.5	Fighting and Assaults	217
13.5.1	Assault on a Supervisor	219
13.5.2	Penalty	219
13.6	Sexual Harassment/Misconduct	219
13.6.1	Definition of Sexual Harassment	221
13.6.2	Consensual Sex in the Workplace	223
13.7	Patient/Resident Abuse	223
13.8	Lateness	224
13.9	Rules Relating to Personal Appearance	224
13.10	Illegal Strikes/Strike-Related Misconduct	227
13.10.1	Definition of Illegal Strike	227
13.10.2	Discipline of Union Officials	230
13.10.3	Onus of Proof	231

CHAPTER 14. NON-DISCIPLINARY DISCHARGE

14.1	Innocent Absenteeism	232
14.2	Effect of Benefit Plans	234
14.3	Employee Disability and the Duty to Accommodate	235
14.3.1	Prohibition Against Disability-Based Discrimination	235
14.3.2	Definition of “Disability”	237
14.3.3	<i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Requirements: The Effect of <i>Meiorin</i>	238
14.3.4	Order of Proceeding	240
14.3.5	The Employee’s Duty	241
14.3.6	The Employer’s Duty	244
14.3.7	The Union’s Duty	249
14.3.8	Accommodation outside the Bargaining Unit	250
14.3.9	Drug and Alcohol Addiction	252
14.3.10	Human Rights Remedies	253
14.4	Certification of Fitness	256
14.5	Last Chance Agreements	258
14.6	Attendance Management Programs	261

CHAPTER 15. OTHER FORMS OF SEPARATION

15.1	Quit	264
15.2	Retirement	265
15.3	Loss of Seniority	268

PART 3. CONTRACT INTERPRETATION

CHAPTER 16. INTERPRETING THE COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT

16.1	The Nature of a Collective Agreement	272
16.2	Limitations on Management Rights	273
16.2.1	Laskin School vs. Residual Rights School	273
16.2.2	General Duty of Fairness	273
16.3	Implied Terms	276
16.4	Use of Extrinsic Evidence to Interpret the Collective Agreement	277
16.4.1	Parole Evidence Rule	277
16.4.2	Ambiguity: Patent and Latent	278
16.4.3	The British Columbia Approach	279
16.4.4	Negotiating History	280
16.4.5	Past Practice	281
16.5	Use of Extrinsic Evidence to Found an Estoppel	282
16.5.1	The Rule in Equity	282
16.5.2	Arbitral Jurisdiction and the Elements of Estoppel . . .	282
16.5.3	Must the Estoppel Relate to an Express Provision of the Collective Agreement?	284
16.5.4	Negotiating History	285
16.5.5	Representations to Individual Employees	287
16.6	Rules of Construction	287
16.6.1	The Plain Meaning Rule	288
16.6.2	Reading the Collective Agreement as a Whole	289
16.6.3	“Inclusion of the One Excludes the Other”	289
16.6.4	Use of Headings	289
16.6.5	<i>Contra Proferentem</i> – Construing against the Proposer	290

CHAPTER 17. ASSIGNMENT OF BARGAINING UNIT WORK

17.1	Assignment to Non-Bargaining Unit Employees	291
17.1.1	Implied Restrictions	291
17.1.2	Express Restrictions: “Work Normally Performed” . . .	293
17.2	Contracting Out	295
17.2.1	Necessity for Express Provision	295
17.2.2	Determining the Scope of Management’s Right to Contract Out	296
17.2.3	Validity of the Contracting Out: Who Is the “True” Employer?	298
17.3	Job Classifications and the Organization of Work	300

CHAPTER 18. SENIORITY RIGHTS DEFINED

18.1	The Meaning and Importance of Seniority	302
-------------	--	-----

18.2	The Measurement and Duration of Seniority	303
18.2.1	Statutory Rights to Maintain Seniority	304
18.3	The Contest Between Seniority and Human Rights	309
18.4	Time Spent outside the Bargaining Unit	312
18.5	Super-Seniority	313

CHAPTER 19. PROMOTION

19.1	Vacancies and Job Posting	315
19.1.1	Reliance on Criteria Not Included in Posting	316
19.2	Promotion Clauses	317
19.2.1	Sufficient Ability and Relative Ability Distinguished	317
19.2.2	Hybrid Clauses	319
19.3	Scope of Arbitral Review	320
19.3.1	Employer's Determination of the Necessary Qualifications	320
19.3.2	Employer's Assessment of Employee Skill and Ability	321
19.4	Validity of Test or Interview	322
19.4.1	Denial of Interview	322
19.4.2	Undue Weight Assigned to Interview	323
19.4.3	Characteristics of a Valid Test Procedure	323
19.4.4	Undue Weight Assigned to Test Results	325
19.5	Trial, training and Familiarization Periods	325
19.6	Remedies	326

CHAPTER 20. LAYOFF AND RECALL

20.1	General Considerations	329
20.2	Compliance with Layoff Procedure	330
20.2.1	Definition of Layoff	330
20.2.2	Layoff Distinguished from Discharge, Termination or Severance	332
20.2.3	Reduction of Hours Constituting Layoff	333
20.2.4	Layoff Distinguished from Transfer	334
20.2.5	Layoff Lasting Less than One Shift	335
20.2.6	Requirement for Notice of Layoff	336
20.3	Bumping Rights	336
20.3.1	Is Chain Bumping Allowed?	337
20.3.2	Scope of Bumping Rights	337
20.3.3	Bumping Up	338
20.4	Recall Rights	339
20.4.1	Status of Employees on Layoff	339
20.4.2	Requirement for Notice of Recall	341
20.4.3	Triggering of Recall Rights	341
20.4.4	Recall Rights and Job Posting Provisions	342

20.4.5	Bumping and the Retention of Recall Rights	343
20.4.6	Remedy for Breach of Recall Rights	343

CHAPTER 21. HOURS OF WORK

21.1	Scheduling of Work Week	345
21.2	Reduction of Work Hours	346
21.3	Voluntary and Compulsory Overtime	346
21.4	Statutory Limitations	347
21.5	Allocation of Overtime	350

CHAPTER 22. WAGES AND BENEFITS

22.1	Wage Rates	352
22.1.1	The Job Classification System	352
22.1.2	Work Performed in a Different Classification	353
22.1.3	What Constitutes Compensable “Work”?	354
22.1.4	Private Arrangements Prohibited	355
22.1.5	Estoppel and the Right to Continuation of a Benefit	355
22.2	Premium and Overtime Rates	356
22.2.1	General	356
22.2.2	Two Types of Overtime Entitlement	357
22.2.3	What Constitutes Compensable “Work”?	358
22.2.4	Only Part of Shift Worked on Premium Rate Day	359
22.3	Call-In Pay	359
22.4	Stand-By Pay	361
22.5	Holiday Pay	362
22.5.1	General	362
22.5.2	Holiday Falling on Non-Working Day	362
22.5.3	Effect of Extended Absence on Entitlement	363
22.5.4	“Qualifying Day” Requirements	364
22.5.5	Holiday Pay and the Rule against Pyramiding	365
22.6	Vacation with Pay	366
22.6.1	General	366
22.6.2	Effect of Extended Absence on Entitlement	367
22.6.3	Vacation Scheduling	368
22.6.4	Calculation of Vacation Pay	369
22.7	The Rule against Pyramiding	372
22.8	Retroactivity	372

CHAPTER 23. LEAVES OF ABSENCE

23.1	Discretionary Leaves of Absence	375
23.2	Sick Leave Benefits	378
23.2.1	General	378
23.2.2	What Constitutes Illness?	378

- 23.2.3 Overlap between Sick Leave and Other Forms of Leave 381
- 23.3 Compliance with Employment Standards and Human Rights Legislation** 382
- 23.3.1 Illness, Disability and Emergency Leave 382
- 23.3.2 Pregnancy and Parental Leave 385
- 23.4 Bereavement Leave** 388

CHAPTER 24. RIGHTS OF TRADE UNIONS

- 24.1 Union Security Clauses** 390
- 24.1.1 Enforcement at Arbitration 391
- 24.1.2 Requirements for Compliance with Union Constitution and Notice to Employer 393
- 24.1.3 Constitutionality of Union Security Clauses 394
- 24.2 Union Activity in the Workplace** 395
- 24.2.1 What Is Union Activity? 396
- 24.2.2 Distinguishing between Protected and Unprotected Union Activity 397
- 24.2.3 Union Activity during Working Hours 398
- 24.3 Discrimination on the Basis of Union Activity** 399

CHAPTER 25. RESPONSIBILITIES OF TRADE UNIONS

- 25.1 General** 401
- 25.2 What Constitutes an Illegal Strike?** 401
- 25.3 Union Liability for Illegal Strikes** 403
- 25.4 Measurement of Damages** 404